

1st Draft: August 12, 2009
2nd Draft: December 22, 2009
3rd Draft: February 15, 2010
4th Draft: July 19, 2011

Chapter 4 Historic Resource Protection Plan

INTRODUCTION

Overview

The aim of historic resource protection is to retain the identity of a community or region as reflected in its natural and built environment. It ensures that the community's heritage and unique character are preserved to be appreciated by future generations. Historic resources provide a sense of place that fosters a connection to the community and a sense of pride among its residents. They also provide an awareness of the community's roots and traditions, and are a valuable educational tool. However, with increasing development pressure, many history structures and sites are sacrificed or altered to the point that their historic value is lost.

East Hanover Township has lost many historic buildings and structures over the years through neglect and demolition for new development; however, many significant resources remain and the Township still has an opportunity to preserve its history.

Township History

The Lower Susquehanna Subbasin, which includes East Hanover Township, contains evidence of a rich and unique history. Archaeological investigations in the subbasin have uncovered artifacts supporting human occupation of the region as far back as 16,000 to 10,000 years ago (the Paleoindian Period). These are



Photo: Courtesy of PHMC

some of the earliest known inhabitants of the North American continent. Native inhabitants subsisted in the region until the early 1700s when the Susquehannock Indians, decimated by disease and warfare with the Seneca, were given land by the new American government in Conestoga Township, Lancaster County, effectively creating one of the first Indian reservations in Pennsylvania. The Susquehannocks became known as the Conestoga Indians and frequently worked for the residents of Lancaster County¹.

By about 1730, Scots-Irish and German settlers arrived in the area. In 1736, a treaty was negotiated with the Indians, which gave the land south of the top of the ridge of the first mountain to the Provincial Government. East Hanover Township was formed in 1842. By 1875, the two main villages in the Township were Grantville and Shellsville. The main east-west road, now Jonestown Road, connected these villages to Harrisburg and Jonestown².

Fort Indiantown Gap was established by the state in 1931 as the primary training base for the Pennsylvania National Guard. The Township's first four-lane highway, Route 22, was completed in 1944 and was used extensively by the military. Interstate 81 was completed in 1969 with an interchange at Grantville. It continues to bring growth to the Grantville area today.

GOALS & OBJECTIVES

Overview

The goals and objectives pertaining to historic resources were formulated by the East Hanover Township Planning Commission and Township residents during the monthly Comprehensive Plan meetings. Goals and objectives aimed at the protection of historic resources are as follows:

Goal #1

Protect the Township's historic and archaeological resources

- Maintain and protect the historic resources that are currently identified and those that present themselves in the future.
- Continue to identify and document significant historic resources.
- Recognize the Township's landscape and agricultural tradition as important elements of the local heritage.
- Discourage demolition and neglect of historic resources.

¹ Source: Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission, Bureau for Historic Preservation

² Source: East Hanover Township Comprehensive Plan, 1993

- Promote adaptive reuse of historic resources.
- Educate property owners on the value and importance of historic resources and opportunities for their protection.

LEGAL FRAMEWORK FOR HISTORIC RESOURCE PROTECTION

Overview

In addition to the National Historic Preservation Act, which authorized the National Register of Historic Places, there are two pieces of legislation in Pennsylvania that enable historic resource protection at the local level: the Local Historic District Act (Act 167 of 1961), and the Pennsylvania Municipalities Planning Code (Act 247).

Pennsylvania's Local Historic District Act (Act 167 of 1961), *“authorizes counties, cities, boroughs, incorporated towns and Townships to create historic districts within their boundaries providing for the appointment of Boards of Historical Architectural Review; empowering governing bodies to protect the distinctive historical character of these districts and to regulate the erection, reconstruction, alteration, restoration, demolition or razing of buildings within the historic districts.”* Historic districts established by local ordinance under the Local Historic District Act must be “certified” by the Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission. Certification means that the district has been determined eligible for the National Register of Historic Places and authorization has been given to protect the character of the district through regulatory means. Under Act 167, applications pertaining to historic resources are reviewed by a township Historical Architectural Review Board (HARB), which then makes a recommendation to the governing body. There are currently no certified historic districts and therefore no HARB in East Hanover Township.

The second piece of legislation is the Pennsylvania Municipalities Planning Code (Act 247). Under Act 247, municipalities may regulate activities related to historic resources by ordinance for the purpose of their protection. A municipally organized historical commission could act in an advisory capacity to the governing body, conducting research and providing data on historic resources.

As in most communities, the main threats to historic resources are: demolition to make way for new development; demolition by neglect; inflexible modern building and land use codes that preclude the ability to adaptively reuse a historic building (e.g., parking and setback requirements); and the practical and financial difficulties of maintaining a historic home or structure. The Local Historic District Act the Pennsylvania Municipalities Planning Code provide municipalities with a means to combat these threats.

East Hanover Township has no zoning ordinance provisions that regulate demolition, alteration, or adaptive reuse of historic resources. Although the Subdivision and Land Development Ordinance of April 1, 2003 (SALDO) contains a historic resource provision, it appears that it effectively applies only to the one building in the Township listed on the National Register. Moreover, while community volunteers are active in the East Hanover Township Historical Society, they are not a formally recognized historical commission acting in an advisory capacity to the Board of Supervisors. Finally, the Historical Society, which currently has six members, has difficulty recruiting new volunteers due in part to a lack of awareness of, and sense of connection to the Township's heritage.

EXISTING HISTORIC RESOURCES

Overview

The discussion of existing conditions provides an inventory of the Township's historic resources, describes issues related to their current condition, and analyzes current protections afforded by the Township and other agencies. Historic resources are categorized as National Register Listed Resources, National Register Eligible Resources, Historic Districts, Historic Resources of Local Significance, and Archaeological Resources.

National Register Resources



John Todd House
(Courtesy PHMC)

The National Register of Historic Places was established by the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966. In Pennsylvania, the program is managed by the Bureau for Historic Preservation (BHP), a department within the Pennsylvania Historical & Museum Commission (PHMC). The program is designed to assist state and local governments, federal agencies, and others identify significant historic and archeological resources worthy of preservation and of consideration in planning and development decisions. Properties listed on the National Register include districts, sites, buildings, structures, and objects that are significant in American history, architecture, archeology, engineering, and culture. To be eligible for listing on the National Register, a property must meet the National Register Criteria for Evaluation. These Criteria require that a property be old enough to be considered historic (generally at least 50 years old) and that it still look much the same way as it was in the past. In addition, the property must meet one of the following criteria³:

- be associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history; or
- be associated with the lives of persons significant in our past; or

³ Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission, *National Register of Historic Places Fact Sheet*.

- embody the distinctive characteristics of a building type, period, or method of construction, or represent the work of a master, or possess high artistic values, or represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction; or
- have yielded or may be likely to yield, information important in history or prehistory.

A committee of BHP staff review information submitted to the BHP to determine whether a resource is eligible for the National Register (using the criteria above). If found eligible, the resource is given a Determination of Eligibility (DOE) and the nomination process can begin. The State Historic Preservation Board reviews all nominations to the National Register. Upon determination of its level of significance and that the resource meets the Criteria for Evaluation, the nomination is sent to the National Park Service (NPS), which either approves or denies the nomination. If approved by the NPS, the resource is entered into the National Register of Historic Places.

Listing on the National Register does the following:⁴

- honor a historic property by recognizing its importance to its local community, state of the nation;
- *encourage* the preservation of historic properties by documenting their significance;
- list properties *only* if they meet the National Register Criteria for evaluation;
- facilitate the review of federally funded, licensed, or permitted projects to determine their effects on historic properties;
- provide **an** opportunity to consult with government agencies to mitigate projects that will adversely affect historic properties;
- provide information about historic resources for planning purposes;
- offer federal tax benefits to owners of income producing (depreciable) historic properties if they rehabilitate their properties according to preservation standards.

Listing on the National Register does not:⁵

⁴ Ibid.

⁵ Ibid.

- restrict the rights of property owners;
- require that properties be maintained, repaired, or restored;
- prevent destruction of a resource by federal, state, local, or private development;
- guarantee that grant funds will be available for projects;
- require property owners to follow preservation standards on their properties (unless they wish to apply for tax benefits).

The John Todd House is the only site in East Hanover Township listed on the National Register of Historic Places. The following excerpt of the description of the house is taken from the Registration Form dated 1988 that was submitted to the PHMC:

The John Todd house is a circa 1772 2 1/2 story five-bay fieldstone building located in East Hanover Township, Dauphin County, Pennsylvania. The house sits today approximately 150 feet south of Meadow Lane (L.R. 22053) on 6.5 acres of the original 190 acre Todd farm. It is surrounded by a mixture of fields, woods, and widely scattered houses in a predominantly rural but developing residential area. Also on the property are a summer house dating from about 1832, a hand dug well, a recently constructed pond and a barn which has been constructed on the foundation of an earlier barn which had burned. The topography of the property and surrounding area is gently rolling with numerous springs emerging from the ground to form rivulets.

The John Todd house, located in East Hanover Township, Dauphin County, Pennsylvania, is one of the few remaining stone homes of the early Scots-Irish settlers who populated "Hanover" Township in large numbers in the 1700's. The house is significant because it is a fine example of vernacular Georgian architecture. That several such houses existed in the township is a little-known fact since most now appear to be gone, but the "Direct Tax" of 1798 for Hanover Township shows that a dozen substantial stone houses were scattered throughout the area at that time.

The general assumption has been that the Scots-Irish built rudimentary dwellings because their pioneering spirit discouraged permanence. While it is true that many tended to move on quickly, it is also true that many spent their entire lives in their original settlements. John Todd was one of the latter. Todd's parents and grandparents settled in Hanover Township (then a larger area than present-day East Hanover Township) prior to 1745 and promptly took up land claims. John was born in 1742 and acquired the 190 acre property on which he built his home in 1771. The exact date of construction of the house is not known. It is felt, however, that construction occurred about 1772 as the 1773 tax records show Todd to be the most highly taxed resident of the township. Since his land holdings were no greater than those of many others at that time, the difference was probably due to his more substantial home.

The simple, but classic, Georgian style of the house reflects Todd's awareness of design as it existed outside the confines of rural frontier area in which he lived. Elements incorporated into the house---or omitted as the case may be---reflect the English-Irish-Scots influence rather than the German influence which was being felt elsewhere in the area at that time. Among the typically Anglo features are blank end walls; dual gable end chimneys, corner fireplaces, massive cooking fireplace with no provision for a bake oven.

Recommendations & Implementation Strategies:

- Identify and document historic resources in the Township that meet the National Register Criteria for Evaluation and apply for National Register designation for these resources.
- Create and continuously update an official list and map of historic resources to which Zoning Ordinance provisions will apply
- Conduct public education through the Township newsletter, website, local news media, and other sources to inform residents of existing National Register Listed resources in the Township, of efforts to list more resources, and of what listing on the National Register means and the benefits it carries.
- Amend the zoning ordinance to include a historic resource protection overlay district that would classify National Register Listed resources as Class 1 resources and strictly regulate impacts on them while providing flexibility for adaptive reuse. The ordinance should also require a historic resource impact study for any development within a specified distance (e.g. 300 feet) of a Class 1 historic resource.
- Incorporate historic resources protection with open space, and recreation planning by including historic resources in open space areas and as recreational destinations.
- Seek technical and financial assistance from historic preservation organizations such as the PHMC.
- Investigate ways to provide owners of historic buildings with informational resources pertaining the rehabilitation and update of their historic buildings.

National Register Eligible

A resource may be deemed eligible for the National Register by the Bureau for Historic Preservation. However, that resource might never obtain a listing on the National Register. Under Section 106, properties that are determined eligible for the National Register are afforded the same treatment as those listed on the National Register. That is, the impact of any federal project on a historic resource must be evaluated and action must be taken to avoid or mitigate the impact of the project. In East Hanover Township, three resources have received a Determination of Eligibility. They are:

- The Appalachian Trail
- Fort Indiantown Gap Historic District (date built 1937)

- The Wallace House/Snodgrass House – Located at 1429 Ridge Road, Grantville. Built 1743, 1770.

Recommendations & Implementation Strategies:

- Identify and document historic resources in the Township that meet the National Register Criteria for Evaluation and apply for National Register designation for these resources.
- Create and continuously update an official list and map of historic resources to which Zoning Ordinance provisions will apply
- Conduct public education through the Township newsletter, website, local news media, and other sources to inform residents of National Register Eligible resources in the Township, of efforts to list more resources, and of the importance of a Determination of Eligibility for the National Register.
- Amend the zoning ordinance to include a historic resource protection overlay district that would classify resources that have received a Determination of Eligibility for the National Register as Class 1 resources and strictly regulate impacts on them while providing flexibility for adaptive reuse. The ordinance should also require a historic resource impact study for any development within a specified distance (e.g. 300 feet) of a Class 1 historic resource.
- Incorporate historic resources protection with open space and recreation planning by including historic resources in open space areas and as recreational destinations.
- Establish partnerships with historic preservation organizations.
- Investigate ways to provide owners of historic buildings with informational resources pertaining the rehabilitation and update of their historic buildings.

Historic Districts

The Fort Indiantown Gap has received a Determination of Eligibility for the National Register. This historic district lies within the grounds of the Fort Indiantown Gap Military Reservation. There are no other formally recognized (i.e., National Register Listed or Eligible) historic districts in the Township and no PHMC Certified districts. However, given their concentrations of significant historic buildings, Grantville and Shellville could be candidates for designation as Historic Districts.

Recommendations & Implementation Strategies:

- Identify and document historic resources in Grantville and Shellville that meet the National Register Criteria for Evaluation and consider applying for designation as a National Register Listed Historic District and/or PHMC certification as an Act 167 Local Historic District.
- Create and continuously update an official list and map of the township's historic districts and their contributing historic resources to which Zoning Ordinance provisions will apply
- Conduct public education through the Township newsletter, website, local news media, and other sources to inform residents of the significance of Grantville and Shellville and what PHMC certification and listing on the National Register means and the benefits they carry.
- Incorporate historic districts with open space and recreation planning by including them as recreational destinations.
- Establish partnerships with historic preservation organizations.

**Locally
Significant
Resources**

Historic resources of local significance are those that are meaningful to the community and important to its identity and heritage. These resources are documented in the book *Historic Sites in East Hanover Township, Dauphin County, PA*, compiled by the Historic Map Committee of the East Hanover Township Historic Society in June, 2000. Among these are the ruins of the Manada Furnace, several early school houses, several mill sites, a number of churches and buildings in and around Grantville and Shellville, and remnants of the Union Canal, including several locks, along the Swatara Creek.

Recommendations & Implementation Strategies:

- Identify and document historic resources in the Township that meet the criteria established by the East Hanover Township Historical Society.
- Create and continuously update an official list and map of historic resources to which Zoning Ordinance provisions will apply.

Recommendations & Implementation Strategies (continued):

- Conduct public education through the Township newsletter, website, local news media, and other sources to inform residents of Locally Significant Historic Resources in the Township and efforts to identify more resources, and of the importance of identifying Locally Significant Historic Resources.
- Amend the zoning ordinance to include a historic resource protection overlay district that would classify Locally Significant Historic Resources as Class 2 resources and strictly regulate impacts on them while providing flexibility for adaptive reuse. The ordinance should also require a historic resource impact study for any development within a specified distance (e.g. 300 feet) of a Class 2 historic resource.
- Incorporate historic resources protection with open space, and recreation planning by including historic resources in open space areas and as recreational destinations.
- Establish partnerships with historic preservation organizations.
- Investigate ways to provide owners of historic buildings with informational resources pertaining the rehabilitation and update of their historic buildings.

Archaeological Resources

Approximately 2,865 archaeological sites are recorded in the Lower Susquehanna River Subbasin, which includes East Hanover Township. Of these, 1,188 can be dated to specific prehistoric time periods and 174 to specific historic time periods⁶. The major research in this region has been conducted by the Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission. Franklin and Marshall College has also conducted research in the subbasin.

According to PHMC records, twenty surveys have been conducted in East Hanover Township, including several prehistoric sites, two farmsteads, and a historic industrial site. The two farmstead sites have a National Register status of "Considered Eligible by Submitter." The remaining sites are noted as "Insufficient Data Available to Make a Decision." The sources of the surveys are "Federal/State Compliance" and "Informant Interview/Amateur Survey." It is very likely that more sites remain undiscovered. Areas that are near a water source hold the most potential for an archaeological site.

⁶ Source: Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission, Bureau for Historic Preservation

Recommendations & Implementation Strategies:

- Work with the PHMC to identify and document archaeological resources in the Township.
- Amend the zoning ordinance to include a historic resource protection overlay district that would include protection of identified archaeological resources. The ordinance should also require a historic resource impact study for any development within a specified distance (e.g. 300 feet) of an archaeological resource.